

PhD Dissertation, October 2012

Harsch-Porter, Sherry

Title: Education as Possibility: Coaching for Persistence

**CONTENTS**

**PROLOGUE** ..... xi

    Identities Emerge and Unfold Through Relationship ..... xi

    Good Fortune or Bad ..... xiii

    Relational Responsibility and Being a First-Gen ..... xv

    Barriers to College Persistence ..... xvi

**INTRODUCTION** ..... 3

    The Central Research Question ..... 4

    Why Does It Matter? ..... 4

        21<sup>st</sup> Century Jobs ..... 4

        Lifetime Earnings Premium ..... 5

        Education: A Public and Private Good ..... 5

        Poverty is the Enemy of College Persistence ..... 6

        Sign Posts and Warnings – A rocky Road ..... 6

    Persistence to Graduation ..... 7

    Broad and Complicated Web ..... 8

    How can Coaching be applied to Persistence? ..... 9

        Social Connectedness ..... 9

        Optimism and Resilience ..... 10

        Whole and Capable ..... 10

    Who Can Coach for Persistence? ..... 10

**RESEARCH PARADIGM** ..... 15

    A Reflection ..... 15

    Bricoleur’s Journey ..... 18

## Education as Possibility: Coaching for Persistence

Theoretical Paradigm and Approach	20
<b>SOCIAL CONSTRUCTIONISM</b> .....	25
A Postmodern Concept	25
Relational Practices	26
A Family of Ideas	26
Knowledge is Communally Created	27
Meaning Making	27
Belief vs. Truth	28
Knowledge as Power	28
Practices Rather than Traits Construct Outcomes	29
Personhood is Created Within Relationship	30
Cultural Norms	31
Identities Shift and Change	31
Language Creates the World	33
Speech Acts	34
Stories Create Past and Possibilities	36
Social Constructionism as an Ever-changing Set of Ideas	37
Social Construction in Action	38
<b>APPRECIATIVE INQUIRY</b> .....	41
Action Research Revisited	41
Inside of Every System – Some Things Are Working	42
Problem-Oriented Language	43
From Problem-Solving to Possibility-Seeking	43
AI and Social Constructionism	43
From Witness to Active Agent	45
Theory Informing Practice	45

## Table of Contents

Constructionist Principle	45
Simultaneity Principle	46
Poetic Principle	46
Anticipatory Principle	46
Positive Principle	46
Inquiry: Positive and Appreciative	47
The Positive Core	47
The Four-D Cycle – Positive by Design	48
Inquiry as Intervention	50
Discovery – What Gives Life	50
Constructing an Interview Guide	51
Conducting an AI Interview	53
Mining for Gold – Synthesizing the Interview Data	53
Dream – What might be?	54
Multi-stakeholder Dialogue - The Power of Scalability	55
Design – How Can it Be?	56
The Provocative Proposition	56
The Wish List	57
Destiny – What Will Be?	58
Implications for Coaching	59
Optimism and Resilience	59
Positivity and the Positivity Ratio	60
Belief in Wholeness	61
<b>EDUCATION – THE KEY TO A GOOD LIFE .....</b>	<b>65</b>
An introduction and invitation to you	65
Education in the 21st Century	67

## Education as Possibility: Coaching for Persistence

Historical Context	69
The State of Public Education - Global	70
Education as a Basic Human Right	70
Human Right or Goal?	71
Education Poverty – Measuring the Marginalized	72
Accident of Birth	73
Geography	73
Class Status	73
Gender	74
The Legacy of Failure	75
Free or Fee?	75
Children and Guns – an Unhealthy Mix	76
The Butterfly Effect	77
Why It Matters	77
Education as Multiplier	78
The Purpose of Education	79
Education in Wealthy Nations	80
The State of Public Education - USA .....	82
The Free Common School – Public Education	82
A Study in Contradictions – Other People’s Children	82
Not a Protected Right Under U. S. Law	85
Financial and Education Poverty – A Vicious Cycle	87
Poverty - Not An Equal Opportunity	88
Clustering - High Poverty Schools	89
Affordability – A Major Barrier	90
21st Century Student – The Myth of the Co-Ed .....	92

## Table of Contents

Persistence is a challenge	92
An 'F' in Mission 101 - Colleges That Fail	93
Profits Poison Education .....	97
Buying Credibility	97
Feeding the Beast – Over-Recruitment	99
Serving the Under-Served	100
Buyer Beware	100
Fraud and Deceit	100
Student Protection Unraveled by Politics	102
In Debt Without a Diploma – or a Job	102
Expense or Investment?.....	103
Post-Secondary Education – The Key to Opportunity	103
The Big Payoff	104
21 <sup>st</sup> Century Jobs	104
Throwing Money at the Problem	106
The Benefits of Higher Education .....	106
Financial	106
Beyond Money	107
A Rising Tide – Benefits to the Community	108
Coaching and Persistence – A Change in Conversation	109
<b>PERSISTENCE</b> .....	<b>115</b>
Placing Students at the Center	115
Student Departure and Retention	115
Stop Out vs. Drop Out	116
Literature on Persistence	116
A Relational View of Persisting	118

## Education as Possibility: Coaching for Persistence

Rites of Passage	119
Navigating the Stages	122
<b>COACHING</b> .....	127
Coaching Conversations in Everyday Exchanges	127
Mapping the Field - What is coaching?	127
Body of Research	128
The Broad Appeal of Coaching	130
Special Interest Groups	130
Coaching Frameworks and Foundation	131
The Dodo Bird Effect – No One Right Way	131
While the Field Waits .... Some Distinguishing Characteristics	132
Mentoring vs. Coaching – A Rose by Another Name?	133
Coaching as a Marketing and Retention Tool	135
Two Coaching Paradigms – A Comparison	135
The Individualist Frame	136
The Relational Frame	137
Coaching as Relational Practice .....	143
The Between	144
Small Shift – Big Difference	145
Social Construction and Coaching	145
Knowledge is Communally Created	146
All Meaning is Local and Open to Change	147
Belief is Not the Same as Truth	147
Power is the Dark Side of Knowledge	148
Identity is Created Within Relationship	149
Identities Change	150

## Table of Contents

Identities Constrict and Strangle	150
Language Creates the World	151
Speech Acts	152
Stories Create The Past and Possibilities	153
The Power of Positive – Persistence Coaching	154
No Ultimate Truth	155
Multi-Relational	155
Is Persistence Coaching Worth the Effort? .....	156
Waste of Human Potential	156
Benefits of a College Degree	156
Risk to the Country’s Economic Viability	156
A Public and Private Good	157
<b>FUTURE DIRECTIONS</b> .....	161
Societal Challenges	161
College readiness Does not Begin in High School	161
Poverty is the Enemy of Education	162
Challenges Specific to Coaching	162
Differences in the student population	162
Life changes that affect the student	163
Coaching Process Success Factors	163
Ethical Issues	164
What Might Come Next?	164
Persistence Coaching as Action Research	165
The End is Just the Beginning	165
<b>APPENDIX 1</b> .....	169
An Invitation .....	170

Education as Possibility: Coaching for Persistence

An Outline for Conversation – The Questions.....	170
REFERENCES .....	175
BIOGRAPHY .....	185